



# Town of Brookhaven Long Island

## Minutes

Mark Lesko, Supervisor

Carmans River Technical Advisory Committee

November 10, 2010

Town of Brookhaven

Members Present: Dr. Lee Koppelman, Chair (Center for Public Policy, SUNY SB), Henry Bokuniewicz (SUNY SB School of Marine Science), Steven Colabufo (SCWA), Eva Greguski (TOB PELM), Jeff Kassner (TOB PELM), Andrew Rapiejko (*Prospective Member* - SCDHS), Chris Schubert (USGS), Mary Anne Taylor (CDM), Steve Terracciano (USGS).

Members Absent: Tullio Bertoli (TOB PELM), John Turner (TOB PELM).

Others: Karen Blumer (Open Space Preservation Trust), Pelops Daminanos (Damianos Realty Group), Julie Hargrave (Central PB Commission), MaryAnn Johnston (ABCO), Robert Kessler (CSYL), Liz Krolik-Alexander (TOB CD#4), Kevin McAllister (Peconic Baykeeper), Johan McConnell (SYCA), Michael Madigan (Open Space Council), Dan Morris (Open Space Council), Beth Motschenbacher (LI Pine Barrens Society), John Pavacic (Central PB Commission), Bill Spitz (DEC), Tom Talbot (Middle Island Civic), Dave Thompson (Open Space Preservation Trust), Chic Voorhis (NP&V), Tom Williams (Post Morrow Foundation).

### 1. General Remarks

- **Dr. Koppelman** opened the meeting with the question, "Is there any reason why the data can't be summarized?" **Jeff Kassner** noted that it is a large task but that TOB will begin the work. He mentioned using his stormwater manager and GIS staff to assist with the project. **Bill Spitz** presented additional DEC data. **Jeff Kassner** also mentioned that he and **Chris Schubert** are meeting next Thursday to discuss retrieving data from USGS. **Chic Voorhis** is awaiting release of the data he culled for the county.
- **Steve Terracciano** updated the TAC on the USGS analysis of the O'Malley thesis. He stated that the student looked at whole water –USGS looks at dissolved water – which makes the comparison difficult. A full report is expected next week.

### 2. Review of Minutes

- Minutes of November 3 meeting reviewed and corrected. Minutes were approved.

Department of Planning, Environment and Land Management

Tullio Bertoli, Commissioner

Brenda Prusinowski, AICP, Deputy Commissioner

One Independence Hill • Farmingville • NY 11738 • Phone (631) 451-6400 • Fax (631) 451-6419

[www.brookhaven.org](http://www.brookhaven.org)

Printed on recycled paper

### 3. Presentation: Carmans River Protection Working Group Findings

- **Adrienne Esposito**, Executive Director of Citizens Campaign for the Environment and Chair of the Carmans River Protection Working Group, delivered their report on the findings of their three-year study. [see website] She noted that Nelson Pope & Voorhis's final written report on the invasive species in the Upper and Lower Lakes is due April 2011. [NP&V was contracted by Suffolk County to conduct studies of invasive species in both Canaan Lake and the Upper and Lower Yaphank Lakes.]
- **Dr. Koppelman** asked if there was an examination of invasive species in the river or just the lakes. **Chic Voorhis** indicated it was just in the lakes. He noted a website for further study: [www.suffolkcountylakes.net](http://www.suffolkcountylakes.net). Later, during Public Comment, **Dave Thompson** indicated the invasive species do not grow in running water, thus they are not found in the river.
- **Dr. Koppelman** asked if the committee feels the research is complete and adequate or does there need to be more. **Adrienne Esposito** responded that she is hoping for ongoing input as new research is conducted and new technologies are discovered.
- **Dr. Koppelman** asked if there was a cost estimate for the removal. She indicated the Nelson Pope & Voorhis report will have those estimates.
- **Dr. Koppelman** asked if there are other elements to study that could provide further input into this work. **Chic Voorhis** said the information on the Suffolk County lakes website is relevant, and thinks the study is applicable to other lakes on Long Island.
- **Dr. Koppelman** indicated the good work of the Working Group cannot be implemented without Town Board approval. **Adrienne Esposito** indicated that she is delivering a presentation of their findings to the Town Board on November 23.
- **Jeff Kassner** noted that often biomass plays a roll in nutrient balance. Does she know what will happen when it is removed? **Adrienne Esposito** indicated that the water quality is good, and the "after care" recommendations should mitigate any loss to the balance. **Chic Voorhis** doesn't think the removal of the invasive species should upset a balance, but will investigate and report back.
- **Henry Bokuniewicz** asked if the two invasive plants identified are the Cabomba weed and variable leaf milfoil. **Adrienne Esposito** replied yes. He inquired if there are invasive animal species, such as ducks or geese. **Jeff Kassner** said no. **Chic Voorhis** confirmed this, as NP&V conducted a shoreline study.

### 4. Committee Reports and Review of Assignments

- **Jeff Kassner** discussed land use north of Route 25, as the question was posed by **Bill Spitz** at last week's meeting. **Jeff Kassner** proposed enlarging the study area (for study purposes only) to Whiskey Road, which lies north of the groundwater divide, and by using man-made boundaries on the east and west. **Bill Spitz** concurred, saying that the TAC should look at the largest possible area first.

- **Dr. Koppelman** asked if an estimate can be made for pollutant loading and what are the standards. **Jeff Kassner** indicated it can only be known when an EIS is done and the Suffolk County Health Department standards are used for assessment. **Dr. Koppelman** stated that those standards are not strict enough and are different in nature.
- **Mary Anne Taylor** asked **Dr. Koppelman** to reiterate the charge of the TAC. **Dr. Koppelman** gave an example of standards he might consider: for new development, there should be no additional nitrogen or pollutants added to the river and all stormwater must be kept on site. **Mary Anne Taylor** indicated that the “Temporal and Spatial” paper [see website] indicates nitrogen isn’t really a concern. **Dr. Koppelman** indicated the TAC be concerned with how we can move forward and maintain the health of the river, i.e. there should be no detriment to the river. **Mary Anne Taylor** asked if the Study Group has set goals – whether the goal is to preserve existing conditions or enhance them, or maintain specific water quality criteria in the river or specific habitats in the watershed would help to focus the work. **Dr. Koppelman** stated that they are still working on them, but they have agreed that a 2.5 ppm/L limit is reasonable. His goal would be for protection, preservation and enhancement of the river and the watershed. **Andrew Rapiejko** asked for the context of that limit – surface water or groundwater? **Dr. Koppelman** said that point was not resolved.
- **Dr. Koppelman** gave an update of the core boundary issue discussed at the Study Group meeting on 11.3. Although there was considerable disagreement, he agreed that all points of view would be considered.
- **Mary Anne Taylor** asked how one judges the success of the management plan if specific objectives are not defined. **Bill Spitz** said that ongoing monitoring is key.
- **Bill Spitz** asked if there is a connection between invasive species and water quality impairment. **Chic Voorhis** said there is analysis on the Suffolk Lakes website.
- **Andrew Rapiejko** reported on the private and public potable well data available. He circulated a database with approximately 1500 samples and any analyte detected is on the spreadsheet. He is also going to circulate a database produced by Cashin Associates. He has still yet to scan surface water and [??] water data. He is also compiling profile well data and will present that information next week.
- **Henry Bokuniewicz** presented a long term monitoring analysis summary. He indicated that he needs to integrate USGS paradigms and in an effort to keep what programs we currently have, monitoring programs should be ongoing. He also indicated that an estimate of a continuous monitoring site should be cost-estimated fairly quickly. **Steve Terracciano** noted that USGS does not currently have one on the Carmans River and would require funding. **Dr. Koppelman** asked that all comments be emailed prior to the next meeting. He also asked for all cost estimates to be worked up immediately and provide a rationale for each.
- **Dr. Koppelman** reminded the group to consider a GIS proposal similar to the existing one in Nassau County and to provide a cost estimate.

- **Bill Spitz** responded to an earlier comment by Karen Blumer at a previous meeting regarding oil spills. He indicated that DEC has information on spills, and his research indicates that the sites comport with the boarder findings of the CDM model.
- **Steve Terracciano** presented a stream flow system model.

## 5. Public Comment

**Kevin McAllister** noted that there are still legal and technical issues with some of the recommendations of the Working Group, specifically the justification of herbicides. He also indicated the DEC is developing standards and is working with Alexander Smith. He will have those recommendations next week available to present.

- **Tom Talbot** asked for further clarification on the unintended consequences of dredging as mentioned earlier by Jeff Kassner. **Dr. Koppelman indicated that should be a work item for Jeff Kassner to address next week.** **Tom Talbot** also noted that an EIS was conducted for some Route 25 projects, notably Sandy Hills and Breslin. Ben's Paints did not require an EIS, as it is a re-build from a fire.
  - **Karen Blumer** distributed a summary of questions relating to the CDM model. She also presented a map provided by BNL. **Steve Terracciano** noted that vertical dimensions must be considered and the CDM model does that; the BNL map does not.
  - **Chic Voorhis** stated there must be a reasonable nexus between land use and the river. Project EIS's don't just look at Article 6 and nitrogen load, but also considers stormwater and all reports are available on the Town's website. He also noted that the Breslin project has to meet a 2.5ppm/L standard, as it is a project of regional significance. He distributed an analysis of water quality data that the Study Group will be reviewing.
6. **Mary Anne Johnston** asked if other hydrologists are being invited to speak as Chic Voorhis is able to participate. **Eva Greguski** indicated that the meetings are open to everyone and she has invited all of those interested, without prejudiced, and that the invitations are free to circulate to outside interested parties. **Mary Anne Johnston** said that **Chic Voorhis** did not mention that the Sandy Hills project is in constant litigation and there is disagreement about whether their Change of Zone was received. She also mentioned the Suffolk County Lakes data should be evaluated by the committee.

## 7. Schedule next meeting

- Next meeting is scheduled for Wednesday, November 17 at 9AM in the WORK SESSION ROOM, THIRD FLOOR.

## 8. Adjourn