



Town of Brookhaven Long Island

Mark Lesko, Supervisor

Minutes

Carmans River Study Group
December 22, 2010
Town of Brookhaven

Members Present: Dr. Lee Koppelman, Chair (Center for Public Policy, SUNY SB), Dick Amper (LI Pine Barrens Society), Tullio Bertoli (TOB PELM), Pelly Damianos (Damianos Realty Group), Eva Greguski (TOB PELM), Jeff Kassner (TOB PELM), Mike Kelly (Long Island Builders Institute), Liz Krolik-Alexander (TOB CD#4), Kevin McAllister (Peconic Baykeeper), Kevin McDonald (Nature Conservancy), Charles Mancini (Long Island Builders Institute), Matt Miner (TOB Sup's Office), John Pavacic (Central PB Commission), Peter Scully (NYS DEC), William Spitz (NYS DEC), Tom Williams (Carmans River Partnership).

Members Absent: Julie Hargrave (Central PB Commission), John Turner (TOB PELM), Bob Wieboldt (Long Island Builders Institute).

Others: Karen Blumer (Open Space Preservation Trust), Larry Britt (Caithness Energy), David Clemens (Longwood Public Library), Robert Dooley (Attorney for Birchwood Civic Association), Mel Lantz (Trout Unlimited), Gail Lynch-Bailey (MI Civic Association), Michael Madigan (Open Space Council), Beth Moteschenbacher (LI Pine Barrens Society), Regina Seltzer (League of Women Voters), Doug Swesty (Trout Unlimited), Tom Talbot (MI Civic Association), Dave Thompson (Open Space Preservation Trust), Chris Visco (Trout Unlimited), Chic Voorhis (NP&V).

1. General Remarks

- **Dr. Koppelman** distributed an outline of recommendations and implementation strategies, modified from a previously distributed document (see website for "Implementation: Recommendations for Action). **Peter Scully** suggested moving rezoning up to a higher priority on the list (from "o" to "b").

2. Review of Minutes

- Minutes of December 15 were reviewed and corrected. Minutes were accepted.

3. Review of Draft Chapters

- **Tullio Bertoli** distributed a new draft of the introduction.

Department of Planning, Environment and Land Management

Tullio Bertoli, Commissioner

Brenda Prusinowski, AICP, Deputy Commissioner

One Independence Hill • Farmingville • NY 11738 • Phone (631) 451-6400 • Fax (631) 451-6419

www.brookhaven.org

4. Core Expansion and TDR Update

- **Tullio Bertoli** distributed new drafts of the proposed core expansion and the TDR proposal. **Charlie Mancini** said serious alternatives to expanding the core need to be discussed. **Jim Tripp** said an alternative needs to be devised if LIBI doesn't fully support the plan. **Peter Scully** said one of the outcomes can be recommendations for zoning and should move up the priority list (see general remarks above).
- **Jim Tripp** said all publicly owned land should be zoned as conservatively as possible. **Tullio Bertoli** asked what jurisdiction we have to do that. **Kevin McDonald** said a municipality zoning already public land has no precedence; transferring out is better than re-classifying the zoning. **Charlie Mancini** said to what extent we can preserve development rights and that gives us more opportunity for preservation.
- **Dick Amper** said we shouldn't be concerned about process as much as making recommendations. **Jim Tripp** asked if we can create TDRs for public land; **Dick Amper** said it is a policy decision, but we must protect the land owners first.

5. Report from Technical Advisory Committee (Jeff Kassner)

- **Jeff Kassner** recapped the morning meeting with a summary of the nitrogen standard discussion. He explained the TAC is recommending a non-degradation policy. **Kevin McDonald** said the 2.5ppm standard is too permissive, doesn't fully reflect ecological impacts and should be subjected to further review. **Dr. Koppelman** said ongoing research is being recommended, and they can only make recommendations based upon current data. **Jim Tripp** agreed with the non-degradation policy and suggested looking at the Clean Air Act for further guidance.
- **Kevin McAllister** said New York State is developing nutrient standards and a link should be made between the land use plan and the water quality standard. **Liz Krolik-Alexander** said is the 2.5ppm standard for the entire watershed. **Bill Spitz** said it is a property line standard in the watershed. **Charlie Mancini** said there is still a small lot issue as it relates to property rights.
- **Dick Amper** distributed a proposed list of 25 recommendations. There was consensus on several; the group agreed to discuss these further at the next meeting after they have had time to review them. (SEE 12/29 MINUTES FOR CONSENSUS RESULTS)

6. Public Comment

- **Robert Dooley** asked for a clarification of the model as it relates to the northern boundary. He asked how the boundary will be determined and asked if a plan was devised for when the results are released.
 - **Doug Swesty** said the DEC Biological Assessment (see website) shows degradation in water quality at two sampling stations. The plan should be specific as to why there is degradation.
-

- **Karen Blumer** said the cumulative impact must be studied. The watershed was 40,000 acres 2 years ago.
- **Regina Seltzer** asked for a clarification on the entire process.

7. Schedule next meeting

- Next meeting is scheduled for December 29 at 11:30AM in the OLD PELM CONFERENCE ROOM, FIRST FLOOR

8. Adjourn

Prepared by Eva Greguski, TOB PELM
