



Town of Brookhaven Long Island

Mark Lesko, Supervisor

Minutes

Carmans River Technical Advisory Committee
December 22, 2010
Town of Brookhaven

Members Present: Dr. Lee Koppelman, Chair (Center for Public Policy, SUNY SB), Tullio Bertoli (TOB PELM), Steven Colabufo (SCWA), Eva Greguski (TOB PELM), Jeff Kassner (TOB PELM), Chris Schubert (USGS), Bill Spitz (DEC), Mary Anne Taylor (CDM),

Members Absent: Henry Bokuniewicz (SUNY SB School of Marine Science), Andrew Rapiejko (*Prospective Member* - SCDHS), Steve Terracciano (USGS), John Turner (TOB PELM).

Others: Dick Amper (LI Pine Barrens Society), Karen Blumer (Open Space Council), Larry Britt (Caithness Energy), David Clemens (Longwood Library), Michael Domino (NFEC), Liz Krolik-Alexander (TOB CD#4), Michael Madigan (Open Space Council), Kevin McAllister (Peconic Baykeeper), Kevin McDonald (Nature Conservancy), John Pavacic (Central PB Commission), Regina Riel (MI Resident), Doug Swesty (Trout Unlimited), Tom Talbot (Middle Island Civic), Dave Thompson (Open Space Preservation Trust), Tom Williams (Post Morrow Foundation), Christ Visco (Trout Unlimited), Chic Voorhis (NP&V).

1. General Remarks

- None.

2. Review of Minutes

- Minutes of December 15 meeting reviewed and corrected. Minutes were approved.

3. Committee Reports and Review of Assignments

- **Mary Anne Taylor** indicated that the updated elevation data had been incorporated into the model will be ready to present preliminary results next week.

4. Discussion of TAC recommendation – nitrogen management plan

Department of Planning, Environment and Land Management

Tullio Bertoli, Commissioner

Brenda Prusinowski, AICP, Deputy Commissioner

One Independence Hill • Farmingville • NY 11738 • Phone (631) 451-6400 • Fax (631) 451-6419

www.brookhaven.org

Printed on recycled paper

- **Dr. Koppelman** opened the meeting with a brief discussion on nitrogen management. **Chris Schubert** said 2.5ppm standard is consistent and already established in the region. **Jeff Kassner** said we need to be consistent in our language – groundwater versus surface water. **Mary Anne Taylor** said we should follow **Henry Bokuniewicz’s** recommendations for long-term monitoring for more data so we can achieve an overall nitrogen standard.
- **Jeff Kassner** asked about a standard for small lots. Ample discussion but no resolution.
- **Dr. Koppelman** asked what would be the toughest standard. **Mary Anne Taylor** said it would be misleading to only look at nitrate nitrogen. **Bill Spitz** said when the model looks at total nitrogen concentrations, it presumes there is no ammonia and that is not necessarily true.
- A discussion ensued on nitrate conversions to total nitrogen to achieve a standard. **Chris Schubert** asked if we aren’t going to face an ammonia problem in the 0-2 year boundary. **Dr. Koppelman** said most of that land is in public hands already.
- **Bill Spitz** said the primary goal should be to maintain the existing river quality and new development should have no additional impact. **Chris Schubert** said parallel efforts should be considered for BMPs and there is an opportunity to improve the river. **Dr. Koppelman restated the goal: To avoid any further degradation of the river.**
- **Dr. Koppelman** began a general discussion on flooding and stormwater and said any new development should have on-site mitigation. **Jeff Kassner** said that is already part of our code. **Bill Spitz** said we need to also look at state and county discharges. **Dr. Koppelman** suggested a ban of deicing salts in the 0-2 year band. **Steve Colabufo** said that is extremely difficult to implement and is a matter of public safety and municipality participation. **Chris Schubert** said alternatives can be recommended. **Bill Spitz** agreed, stating if stormwater can be retained, it can become groundwater rather than go to the river in high concentrations. **Mary Anne Taylor** asked if stormwater is sampled; **Jeff Kassner** said we don’t routinely sample. **Mary Anne Taylor** said we should recommend monitoring some outfalls. **Bill Spitz** said there also needs to be a requirement to build new infrastructure.

5. Public Comment

- **Kevin McAllister** said Westchester County has reviewed de-icing practices and developed BMPs. He advocates taking a conservative approach on the nitrogen standards. He encouraged referring to the forthcoming work prepared by the DEC.
- **Doug Swesty** said there is ample precedent for a “no salt zone.” He distributed a letter regarding the historical origins and watershed boundaries.
- **Dick Amper** said if the TAC isn’t sure, they should be as conservative as possible for the northern boundary. He also agreed with no further degradation of the river, but said the more the TAC can recommend, the more policy resources the Study Group will have. He inquired about the Jordan letter discussed the week prior and asked if the standards are attainable. **Jeff Kassner** said yes, but some of

the recommendations are premature. **Mary Anne Taylor** said nitrate is a good place to start but it needs more study.

- **Michael Domino** distributed a report from the NFEC and referred to a visit made by USGS the week prior. **Chris Schubert** said a judgment cannot be made from the walking tour, and that the problem needs to be seen in 3D. **Dr. Koppelman** said a full-blown study needs to be conducted.
- **Regina Riel** asked if the US Army Corps was invited to participate in the study. **Dr. Koppelman** said no, as they cannot make a scientific contribution. She indicated flooding on Bartlett Road. **Jeff Kassner** said that is an area of vernal ponds and a complex soil system.
- **Karen Blumer** distributed a paper by Gil Hanson. She suggested the TAC make recommendations beyond the 0-5 year boundaries.
- **Dave Clemens** asked what the alternative to road salt is. **Steve Colabufo** said calcium magnesium acetate, but it's 20 times more expensive.
- **Chic Voorhis** said most people use total nitrogen as standards. He said there is a data gap, and all contributing sources to the river are not being documented (i.e. existing development).

6. Schedule next meeting

- Next meeting is scheduled for December 29 at 9AM in the OLD PELM CONFERENCE ROOM, FIRST FLOOR.

7. Adjourn

Prepared by Eva Greguski, TOB, PELM
