



# Town of Brookhaven Long Island

## Minutes

Mark Lesko, Supervisor

Carmans River Technical Advisory Committee  
November 3, 2010  
Town of Brookhaven

Members Present: Dr. Lee Koppelman, Chair (Center for Public Policy, SUNY SB), Henry Bokuniewicz (SUNY SB School of Marine Science), Eva Greguski (TOB PELM), Jeff Kassner (TOB PELM), Andrew Rapiejko (*Prospective Member* - SCDHS), Chris Schubert (USGS), Mary Anne Taylor (CDM).

Members Absent: Tullio Bertoli (TOB PELM), Steven Colabufo (SCWA), Steve Terracciano (USGS), John Turner (TOB PELM).

Others: Karen Blumer (Open Space Preservation Trust), Julie Hargrave (Central PB Commission), Robert Kessler (CSYL), Liz Krolik-Alexander (TOB CD#4), Kevin McAllister (Peconic Baykeeper), Johan McConnell (SYCA), Michael Madigan (Open Space Council), Dan Morris (Open Space Council), John Pavacic (Central PB Commission), George Proios (Brookhaven ZBA), Don Seubert (ABCO), Bill Spitz (DEC), Tom Talbot (Middle Island Civic), Dave Thompson (Open Space Preservation Trust), Jim Tripp (Carmans River Partnership), Chic Voorhis (NP&V), Bob Wieboldt (LIBI), Tom Williams (Post Morrow Foundation).

### 1. General Remarks

- **Dr. Koppelman** opened the meeting with the following items:
  - What is the current chemical status of the river? What data is missing? How can we fill in the missing data? What are the long range needs for synoptic sampling? How will the results be packaged?
  - Consider the issue of chlorides. **Andrew Rapiejko** indicated that a study by Cashin Associates noted an increase in chlorides. He also has access to additional historic data and that can be shared at the next meeting.
  - What public data is available? **Chris Schubert** stated significant public data is available and a query should be conducted for different parts of the watershed. He can work with TOB on the longitudinal/latitudinal boundaries, and give them a demonstration of how to conduct their own data queries. **Chris Schubert will work with Jeff Kassner to complete the data retrieval(s).** **Henry Bokuniewicz** stated that SUNY does not have water quality data, only fish data.
  - **Jeff Kassner** has a preliminary map for points of discharge and is adding Chic Voorhis's data presented at the Carmans River Conference to the

Department of Planning, Environment and Land Management  
Tullio Bertoli, Commissioner

Brenda Prusinowski, AICP, Deputy Commissioner

One Independence Hill • Farmingville • NY 11738 • Phone (631) 451-6400 • Fax (631) 451-6419

[www.brookhaven.org](http://www.brookhaven.org)

Printed on recycled paper

map (after Chic receives authorization from the county). He will have it ready to present at the next meeting.

- **Henry Bokuniewicz** offered to present a long-term analysis summary for the next meeting.

## 2. Review of Minutes

- Minutes of October 27 meeting reviewed and corrected. Minutes were approved.

## 3. Committee Reports and Review of Assignments

- **Chris Schubert** discussed the O'Malley study brought to the TAC's attention at the last meeting. His staff reviewed the study and though they find no issues with the techniques used, further research needs to be conducted on sample holding times and how freezing and thawing affects nitrate levels. After contacting his national lab, he should have more details on the study next week. **Henry Bokuniewicz** wanted further clarification on whether the nitrates are in the river or in the lakes.
- **Andrew Rapiejko** presented an existing data report and sample data sheets from test wells. He presented a map of the Carmans River contributing area in context with other contributing areas (i.e. Forge River, Beaver Dam Creek). He indicated that after running a 100 year contributing area model the boundaries may move north, but it is not known until the model is run. He indicated the east-west boundaries are fairly well established. **Chris Schubert** asked for a clarification of the green and white spaces – Andrew Rapiejko indicated they are shoreline discharge areas (green) or greater than 50 years contributing areas (white).
- **Andrew Rapiejko** distributed a map indicating various SCDHS groundwater study areas in the Carmans River watershed area with accompany data. Sample spreadsheets were distributed, indicating the type of data (including analytes) available.
- **Dr. Koppelman** asked how all of the data can be summarized as we have very little time. He asked what the data informs us of.
- **Dr. Koppelman** asked the TAC to consider how they know if the water is going into the river or under the river (i.e. to the bay). He also asked how deep the wells are. **Andrew Rapiejko** said the wells that the SCDHS typically installs for investigations are profile wells. These wells are drilled to a specific depth and pulled up and sampled about every 10 feet, until the top of the water table is encountered. This method provides a good profile of water quality throughout the various aquifer segments. He continued to say that other factors impact the river as well, but they aren't reflected in the analytes.
- **Dr. Koppelman** asked the group: If you were to design the perfect plan, what would you include?
  - **Mary Anne Taylor** said an ecologist would be helpful to assess the importance of the water quality data.
  - **Chris Schubert** said we need strategies for compiling records and analyzing data, a prioritization of concerns, and a need to consult with a freshwater or stream ecologist.

- **Andrew Rapiejko** said we need to decide exactly what we are concerned with, as the data set is too large. He said he would supply well data to the TAC.
- **Jeff Kassner** said we cannot get distracted from our main goal, which is to determine how land use affects the health of the river. He also said some of the data is legacy data or beyond our control
- **Chris Schubert** said we need to look at data from a holistic view, and determine the difference between nonpoint source loading from assorted land uses and in a general sense.
- **Henry Bokuniewicz** said ultimately the data needs to be looked at statistically.
- **Dr. Koppelman** asked **Andrew Rapiejko, Henry Bokuniewicz and Chris Schubert** to work on a prioritization list.
- **Dr. Koppelman** also asked for fish and invertebrate specialists who might be guest speakers to the TAC.
- **Dr. Koppelman** asked the committee to look at the draft 1981 Carmans River Management Plan, as well as the Temporal and Spatial Variations Study by the next meeting.
- **Mary Anne Taylor** indicated that she has data characterizing the headwaters available, including over a decade of groundwater elevation, standing water and plant monitoring data which she can make available to the committee.

#### 4. Public Comment

- **George Proios** asked the TAC to consider what the current relationship is between Artist Lake and the Carmans River. He indicated there is a sediment loading study available. He underscored the need for a freshwater expert to give testimony to the TAC. He outlined three problems facing the river: 1) overdevelopment; 2) lack of oversight and 3) unresolved storm water issues. He enumerated four things he feels needs to be done:
  - Upzoning
  - Better site plan approval processes
  - Invasive species control
  - Plan for plume clean-up and remediation
- **Dr. Koppelman** indicated the issue of implementation is for the elected officials.
- **Karen Blumer** presented maps with additional plumes. She asked if the TAC can look at outlying points. **Chris Schubert** indicated that water doesn't always go into the river – sometimes it goes under. She indicated that the TAC needs to expand the discussion to the watershed as a whole. **Dr. Koppelman** said that for the sake of time, anytime the TAC discusses the river, they are talking about the entire watershed. He also indicated that this study looks at the watershed and not the bay.
- **Karen Blumer** expressed concern about nitrate loading from STPs, which led to a longer discussion about STPs. **Mary Anne Taylor** indicated the county-run STP in the area is meeting its standards. **Andrew Rapiejko** also indicated that an STP discharge of 10ppm vs. private home cesspools (which discharge at more

than 50ppm each) needs to be considered. (Other public comments further down continue this discussion.)

- **Kevin McAllister** said TetraTech has created protocols to look at the health of rivers. He asked about nutrient loading – what are the standards for restoring ecological health? The New Jersey Pine Barrens is 2.0. How can we restore ecology in the receiving waters?
- **Dave Thompson** asked that we streamline the process and consider the restoration processes used on Cape Cod. He distributed a brochure from the Sea Run Brook Trout Coalition. He also indicated that the DEC has done an extensive survey on habitats.
- **Dick Amper** asked “What does the river need to survive?” He asked what resources are necessary to refine information. **Dr. Koppelman** said **Henry Bokuniewicz, with the help of Chris Schubert and Andrew Rapiekjko** is doing an outline of research needs with associated costs.
- **Bob Wieboldt** expressed a concern that further increasing stormwater standards adds to an already large burden. He expressed that developers already pay for SWPPs, are required to keep water onsite, etc. and inquires about where their money is going. **Jeff Kassner** will speak with the Division of Engineering and report back. **Bob Wieboldt** also asked about the dilution model and 10ppm – are they synonymous? **Chic Voorhis** said that STP discharge cannot be seen as a replacement for nitrogen discharge. There needs to be separate standards – one for treatment plants and one for overall control. **Bob Wieboldt** also asked is anyone looking at collective EIS’s for all development within the watershed. **Jeff Kassner** indicated that he is assembling that data.
- **Jim Tripp** said the state and county need to agree on STP standards. He asked what the total amount of nitrogen is that we can put into a system and get the output we want. Suggested the use of nitrogen “credits” to be distributed not on a first-come, first-serve basis, but rather one based on project worthiness.
- **Don Seubert** said that it is critical to look at meteorological data and asked if SUNY SB is doing a microclimate study? **Henry Bokuniewicz** said there is currently no funding for that study, but that the model should be run on some averages and some extremes. **Don Seubert** said fertilizer application education should be considered.
- **Dan Morris** asked for documentation of studies indicating that water goes under or into the river. **Chris Schubert** said the USGS has conducted those studies and can provide graphics of a cross section to show everyone how it works. **Dan Morris** indicated that DEC Superfund data could also be useful to the study.

## 5. Schedule next meeting

- Next meeting is scheduled for Wednesday, November 10 at 9AM in the OLD PELM CONFERENCE ROOM, FIRST FLOOR.

## 6. Adjourn