



# Town of Brookhaven Long Island

Mark Lesko, Supervisor

## Minutes

Carmans River Study Group  
January 19, 2011  
Town of Brookhaven

Members Present: Dr. Lee Koppelman, Chair (Center for Public Policy, SUNY SB), Dick Amper (LI Pine Barrens Society), Tullio Bertoli (TOB PELM), , Eva Greguski (TOB PELM), Jeff Kassner (TOB PELM), Mike Kelly (Long Island Builders Institute), Liz Krolik-Alexander (TOB CD#4), Kevin McAllister (Peconic Baykeeper), Kevin McDonald (Nature Conservancy), Charles Mancini (Long Island Builders Institute), Matt Miner (TOB Sup's Office), John Pavacic (Central PB Commission), Peter Scully (NYS DEC), William Spitz (NYS DEC), Bob Wieboldt (Long Island Builders Institute), Tom Williams (Carmans River Partnership).

Members Absent: Pelly Damianos (Damianos Realty Group), Julie Hargrave (Central PB Commission), Jim Tripp (Carmans River Partnership), John Turner (TOB PELM).

Others: Frank Beyrodt (Delea Sod Farms), Karen Blumer (Open Space Preservation Trust), Ron Bush (Farmer & resident), David Clemens (Longwood Public Library), Robert Dooley (Attorney for Birchwood Civic Association), Joe Gergela (LI Farm Bureau), MaryAnn Johnston (ABCO), John Kennedy (W&K Farms), Mel Lantz (Trout Unlimited), Gail Lynch-Bailey (MI Civic Association), Kathleen Madigan (Yaphank Resident), Michael Madigan (Open Space Council), Beth Moteschenbacher (LI Pine Barrens Society), Linda Peterson (Yaphank Beautification Committee), Ferdie Schmitt (F&W Schmitt Farm), Ken Schmitt (SC Ag & Farm Protection Board), William Schmitt (Jennifer Smith (Newsday), Josh Slaughter (Legislator Kate Browning's office), Herb Strobel (Hallockville Museum Farm), Doug Swesty (Trout Unlimited), Tom Talbot (MI Civic Association), Dave Thompson (Open Space Preservation Trust).

### 1. General Remarks

- None.

Department of Planning, Environment and Land Management  
Tullio Bertoli, Commissioner

Brenda Prusinowski, AICP, Deputy Commissioner

One Independence Hill • Farmingville • NY 11738 • Phone (631) 451-6400 • Fax (631) 451-6419  
www.brookhaven.org

## 2. Review of Minutes

- Minutes of December 29 were reviewed. Minutes were accepted.

## 3. Subcommittee Update

- **Tullio Bertoli** delivered a summary of the Core Expansion and TDR Subcommittee. He showed a map detailed proposed lands for acquisition and/or re-zoning. He stressed this proposal would result in an additional 800 acres in the Carmans River Watershed being preserved.

## 4. Proposed Recommendations

- **Dr. Koppelman** read the first ten recommendations to the Study Group. The results are as follows:
  - Recommendation 1: Accepted.
  - Recommendation 2: Accepted.
  - Recommendation 3: Accepted.
  - Recommendation 4: Accepted.
  - Recommendation 5a: Accepted.
  - Recommendation 5b: Accepted.
  - Recommendation 6a: Tabled.
  - Recommendation 6b: Need clarification (7 yes, 1 no, 7 abstain, 1 no vote, 4 absent)
  - Recommendation 6c: No vote.
  - Recommendation 6d: Accepted.
  - Recommendation 6e: Accepted.
  - Recommendation 7a: Accepted.
  - Recommendation 7b: Accepted.
  - Recommendation 7c: Accepted.
  - Recommendation 8a: Tabled.
  - Recommendation 8b: Accepted.
  - Recommendation 8c: Accepted.
  - Recommendation 8d: Tabled.
  - Recommendation 9a: Tabled.
  - Recommendation 9b: Tabled.
  - Recommendation 10a: Tabled.
  - Recommendation 10b: Tabled.
  - Recommendation 10c: Tabled.
  - Recommendation 10d: Tabled.

## 5. Public Comment

- **Joe Gergela** expressed disappointment in not engaging farmers as stakeholders. He said impacts to the river can be addressed through Best Management Practices, science and research in conjunction with Cornell Cooperative Extension. He said there are also property rights issues associated with the recommendations presented.
- **Frank Beyrodt** said to consider each stakeholder in the draft plan and see the impact upon various communities.
- **Herb Strobel** said the fee title recommendation is problematic.
- **Ken Schmitt** is opposed to the fee title recommendation.
- **William Schmitt** is opposed to the fee title recommendation. **Dick Amper** suggested adding language to indicate acquired lands would be from willing sellers.
- **Ron Bush** is opposed to fee title recommendation. He also asked that the committee consider the Beaver Dam Creek plume.
- **John Daly** asked if there is data that nitrogen from farmland is contributing to the river.
- **Linda Peterson** raised the issue of farmland being used for dumping at 275 Main Street in Yaphank, 900 feet from the river.
- **Kathleen Madigan** said asphalt is being dumped at 275 Main Street.
- **Mary Anne Johnston** said the civics should have been involved in the process. Objected to Mitch Pally being involved in the Study Group.
- **Karen Blumer** said she was disappointed with the size of the watershed and the findings. **Dick Amper** said she needs to submit more materials, memos and reports. **Jeff Kassner** asked that she provide a rationale for her theory.
- **Mike Madigan** stressed this is a plan to protect the river forever.

## 6. Schedule next meeting

- Next meeting is scheduled for January 26 at 9AM in the WORK SESSION ROOM, THIRD FLOOR.

## 7. Adjourn

Prepared by Eva Greguski, TOB PELM