



# Town of Brookhaven Long Island

Mark Lesko, Supervisor

## Minutes

Carmans River Technical Advisory Committee  
December 29, 2010  
Town of Brookhaven

Members Present: Dr. Lee Koppelman, Chair (Center for Public Policy, SUNY SB), Tullio Bertoli (TOB PELM), Steven Colabufo (SCWA), Eva Greguski (TOB PELM), Jeff Kassner (TOB PELM), Bill Spitz (DEC), Mary Anne Taylor (CDM),

Members Absent: Henry Bokuniewicz (SUNY SB School of Marine Science), Andrew Rapiejko (*Prospective Member* - SCDHS), Chris Schubert (USGS), Steve Terracciano (USGS), John Turner (TOB PELM).

Others: Dick Amper (LI Pine Barrens Society), Karen Blumer (Open Space Council), David Clemens (Longwood Library), Michael Domino (NFEC), Liz Krolik-Alexander (TOB CD#4), Michael Madigan (Open Space Council), Kevin McDonald (Nature Conservancy), Michael Mule (SC Planning), Shawn Puzzo (SBU student), John Pavacic (Central PB Commission), Doug Swesty (Trout Unlimited), Tom Talbot (Middle Island Civic), Dave Thompson (Open Space Preservation Trust), Jim Tripp (EDF), Tom Williams (Post Morrow Foundation), Chris Visco (Trout Unlimited), Chic Voorhis (NP&V).

### 1. General Remarks

- None.

### 2. Review of Minutes

- Minutes of December 22 meeting reviewed and corrected. Minutes were approved.

### 3. Committee Reports and Review of Assignments

- **Mary Anne Taylor** presented the results of her preliminary model. She based her work on determining the groundwater boundary on a 100 year time of travel. She still has to run the model based upon wetter-than-average conditions. The groundwater shed moved slightly north, but still falls south of Route 25.
- **Bill Spitz** noticed most changes to the model are intuitive, but the shape of the north has changed. **Mary Anne Taylor** said the model was refined to reflect stormwater management and recharge basins.

**Tullio Bertoli** asked **Mary Anne Taylor** to clarify the difference between the

Department of Planning, Environment and Land Management

Tullio Bertoli, Commissioner

Brenda Prusinowski, AICP, Deputy Commissioner

One Independence Hill • Farmingville • NY 11738 • Phone (631) 451-6400 • Fax (631) 451-6419

[www.brookhaven.org](http://www.brookhaven.org)

Printed on recycled paper

first and second model simulations. She said she used better data representing streambed elevations (2' contours vs. 5' contours) and the model was ran out an additional 50 years.

- **Dr. Koppelman** asked the TAC to consider the contents of Dr. Marilyn Jordan's letter. **Mary Anne Taylor** said she thought the committee agreed with many concepts but the number used to characterize the river is lower than has been previously discussed. **Jeff Kassner** said there is data missing from her observations, notable data from the USGS and recent SCDHS and Nelson, Pope & Voorhis data. She also uses mean and median interchangeably. **Bill Spitz** concurred, and said, as written, it should not be included in the appendix because it is a confusing presentation. **Jeff Kassner** suggested a peer review letter be drafted and sent to Dr. Jordan.
- **Dr. Koppelman** re-distributed a North Fork Environmental Council Land Use Committee Report dated December 16, 2010. **Jeff Kassner** asked **Mary Anne Taylor** when Route 25 was put in, did it change stormwater and groundwater flow. She responded the elevations are different. **Dr. Koppelman** said it has been asserted that Route 25 has acted like a dam. **Mary Anne Taylor** she is comfortable with asserting groundwater flow south of Route 25 but not north. **Dr. Koppelman** asked if there is any reason to go further north. **Steve Colabufio** said no. **Bill Spitz** has said the boundary is already very conservative. He said the model is the best determination of what's going on below ground, but there is a general confusion between what is stormwater flow and what is groundwater flow. He said we need to evaluate gravity for flooding north of Route 25.

#### 4. Public Comment

- **Chic Voorhis** asked if the model was based on new conditions. **Mary Anne Taylor** said yes. He distributed a memo on missing data gaps, drafted on behalf of LIBI.
- **Doug Swesty** asked how sensitive the model is to start of flow. **Mary Anne Taylor** said she doesn't tell the model where to start flow. He asked where stormwater of Route 25 goes. **Bill Spitz** said the model treats it as recharge. He indicated a correction to the NYS DEC Biological Assessment report (previously distributed). He stated more samples were taken than indicated.
- **Dick Amper** suggested revisiting the 1903/4 map distributed in Doug Swesty's letter. There was a consensus in the TAC that the maps don't depict three dimensions and actual conditions. **Dick Amper** asked to raise questions to Dr. Jordan for clarifications on her letter. **Jeff Kassner** indicated he will send a peer review letter. He also asked if there is anything unsaid that the Study Group might find useful. **Dr. Koppelman** said whatever the TAC cannot determine under a tight deadline has been recommended for major research efforts.
- **Karen Blumer** asked **Mary Anne Taylor** several questions about start of flow. **Mary Anne Taylor** said the model represents long term average conditions. She asked what the groundwater conditions are north of Route 25. **Mary Anne Taylor** said the groundwater likely travels vertically and discharges to the bay. **Jeff Kassner** noted that because the Whiskey Road boundary is included, it does

not mean that the groundwater in that area contributes to the river. She finally asked about the inclusion of the Jordan letter and the O'Malley report and the trends they indicate. **Jeff Kassner** said both have incomplete data collection, but we can use their data in limited ways. She asked about the Gil Hanson paper distributed the week prior. **Jeff Kassner** said there is no relationship, as it reflects ancient conditions and not current conditions. **Steve Colabufo** agreed. She asked if the committee is considering sea level rise. **Dr. Koppelman** said the TAC does not have climatologists and cannot comment.

- **Dave Clemens** distributed a the booklet, *Longwood Long Ago*. He asked about the drainage culverts under Route 25. He asked for a definition of non-degradation. **Dr. Koppelman** said it includes items like stormwater controls, including onsite retention of new development.
- **Mike Madigan** asked about a build-out analysis. **Dr. Koppelman** said the second part of the report will have that information.

#### 5. Schedule next meeting

- Next meeting is scheduled for January 19 at 9AM in the WORK SESSION ROOM, THIRD FLOOR.

#### 6. Adjourn

Prepared by Eva Greguski, TOB, PELM